

JUSTICIA COGNITIVA Y DIVERGENCIA SOCIAL. RESISTENCIA PACÍFICA A TRAVÉS DEL TURISMO COMUNITARIO

Fernanda Navas-Camargo¹

ORCID: 0000-0002-4032-7070

Correo electrónico: jfnavas@ucatolica.edu.co

Resumen

Las actividades de Turismo Comunitario que realizan los pueblos indígenas asentados en las zonas rurales de Bogotá son un medio para lograr justicia social y cognitiva. Éstas han contribuido a la preservación del territorio, la memoria y las tradiciones, demostrando su cosmovisión, ligada a la concepción de una vida buena cuando se vive en armonía con la naturaleza y se valora esta perspectiva por encima de aquella que busca alcanzar la riqueza económica. A través de entrevistas semiestructuradas e historias de vida, se buscó comprender cómo esta forma de turismo permitió a la comunidad preservar lo que para ellos es valioso, a la vez que impidió la proliferación de construcciones urbanizadoras depredadoras. Las acciones se observan desde la Justicia Cognitiva y la Divergencia Social. El primero, debido al conocimiento válido producido in situ, y el segundo, como respuesta a la contradicción de intereses subyacentes al neoliberalismo y la cosmovisión indígena.

Palabras Clave: justicia cognitiva, divergencia social, turismo de base comunitaria, resistencia pacífica.

COGNITIVE JUSTICE AND SOCIAL DIVERGENCE. PEACEFUL RESISTANCE THROUGH COMMUNITY BASED TOURISM

Abstract

Community Based Tourism activities pursued by Indigenous peoples settled in rural Bogotá, is a means for achieving social and cognitive justice. It has helped preserve their

¹Lawyer and International Business Manager. PhD in Education for Integration and Sustainable Human Development. Professor from the Law Faculty of Catholic University of Colombia.

land, memory and traditions, demonstrating their cosmovision of a good life where being able to live in harmony with nature is valued above achieving economic wealth. Semi-structured interviews and life-history methodology were used to understand how these ways of tourism led the community to preserve what is valued for them whilst simultaneously detaining predatory construction expansion. Actions are observed under the scopes of Cognitive Justice and Social Divergence. The first because of the valid knowledge produced in situ, and the second as a response to the contradiction of interests lying beneath neoliberalism and Indigenous cosmovision.

Keywords: cognitive justice, social divergence, community-based tourism, peaceful resistance.

JUSTIÇA COGNITIVA E DIVERGÊNCIA SOCIAL. RESISTÊNCIA PACÍFICA ATRAVÉS DO TURISMO COMUNITÁRIO

Resumo

As atividades de Turismo Comunitário realizadas pelos povos indígenas assentados nas áreas rurais de Bogotá são um meio para alcançar a justiça social e cognitiva. Eles contribuíram para a preservação do território, da memória e das tradições, demonstrando a sua cosmovisão, que está ligada à concepção de uma boa vida quando se vive em harmonia com a natureza e valoriza esta perspectiva acima daquela que procura alcançar a riqueza económica. Através de entrevistas semi-estruturadas e histórias de vida, procuramos entender como essa forma de turismo permitiu à comunidade preservar o que lhes é valioso, ao mesmo tempo em que impediu a proliferação de construções urbanísticas predatórias. As ações são observadas a partir da perspectiva da Justiça Cognitiva e da Divergência Social. A primeira, devido ao conhecimento válido produzido in situ, e a segunda, como resposta à contradição de interesses subjacentes ao neoliberalismo e à visão de mundo indígena.

Palavras-chave: justiça cognitiva, divergência social, turismo comunitário, resistência pacífica.

Introduction

Southernizing knowledge implies recognizing the existence of ways of living and being that differ from the traditional westernized believes of economic wealth and individual success as the pursued way of life. Indigenous communities around the world encounter in their cosmovision that a good life is that in which it is possible to live in harmony with nature and acknowledge that it is more important to protect the land and the wellbeing of the society, than only having economic wealth for a few. Actions pursued under the principles of Community Based Tourism by Indigenous communities settled in rural Bogotá, is a means for achieving both social and cognitive justice because it has helped them preserve their land, memory and traditions, even though in the western world such way of living is perceived as poor and underdeveloped.

Each perspective is rooted in opposed believes and contradiction of interests. In sociology of law the concept of deviation is way too superficial when considering that criminal conducts are the result of the actions of an individual against the norm or the expectations of a given society, without acknowledging that the substantial problem lies in the contradiction of interests and to a lesser extent of values or beliefs (Silva-García, 2012). When bringing that conceptualization into the way diverse forms of tourism are being analytically approached, one can understand why scholars believe that ecotourism is able to offer an economic model and framework under which the development and protection of important ecologies are feasible, but that it is much more likely that it will serve as the Trojan horse of the global economy (McClanaham, Sánchez Parra, & Brisman, 2019) where destruction arrives disguised as development. Scholars have stated that tourism is the prime force today threatening Indigenous homelands and cultures encouraging exploitation, dislocation and desecration (Johnston, 2000). It is true that it has been so in many places, but it is also true that tourism is not the only activity or the most significant one in having those devastating results.

There is also evidence that if certain ways of tourism were to be approached from the perspective of the interests of the communities who develop them and not by the

perspective of neoliberal economic development, the discussions around tourism where to show far more positive outcomes. The purpose still relies in being able to achieve cognitive justice by acknowledging that all people can produce valid knowledge and it is needed to hear the voices of the cognitively marginalized and provide the chance to intervene in global debates (Goyes, Sollund, & South, 2019).

Therefore, this paper will present the case of three different Community-Based Tourism (CBT) initiatives developed, managed and maintained by the people from the community of Usme for decades. The Social Divergence theory is presented as a means of making awareness that making an observance from a different perspective leads to identifying underperceived realities. Different, diverse and divergent are positive and they just need to be observed from a different perspective and the three cases will be examined under its components.

The first component will analyze the meeting area or zone of interaction where people arrive guided by personal, social and context related conditions. Rural area of Bogotá is the first component. The second component is determined by the attitudes assumed by the actors in the given meeting area or zone of interaction in a determined historical moment. The second component are the Indigenous who inhabit rural Bogotá when living in violent and marginal context and transitioning into a society which recognizes their rights, their culture and it is making its own path into peace. The third component is the status under which the actor is identified, the purpose given to them and the expectations of the attributed role. The third component is the community becoming the hosts of leisure and tourism related activities where hospitality is definitive. The fourth and last component is the separation between the lines of action, ideologies and interests of the actors. That fourth component is presented in the divergence of understanding the activity of CBT in the south and in the north. Here in the south it has been positively perceived as a means of empowering women, safeguarding the environment, securing land ownership and having the consolidation of the community as a community (Navas-Camargo, Cubides-Cárdenas, & Caldera Ynfante, 2018). Whilst in the north, it is often called predatory.

The first component: Rural Bogotá

Colombia is a diverse territory. Its diversity underlies in several aspects such as the endogenous species, the cultural differences among its people, and the levels of access to basic services and fulfilment of fundamental rights such as education, decent work, and land access. For over 50 years this last trait has been the one responsible for escalating many of the conflicts still present in the country in terms of endemic violence.

Carlyle (1961) in his paper *Land Distribution and Tenure in Colombia*, tracked the publications made in local journals in 1959 about violence manifestations anticipating the explosion of wider violence manifestations (Carlyle Beyer, 1961). The forecast was accurate and the three most violent guerrillas in Colombian history appeared as a response to the anxiety showed by people regarding the social and economic injustice produced by the unequal land distribution and how it had been underestimated until then. The Armed Revolutionary Forces of Colombia known as FARC by its acronym in Spanish, were founded by 48 peasants in 1964 (Secretariado Nacional de las FARC-EP, 2018). A year later in 1965, the National Liberation Army, ELN by its acronym in Spanish initiated operations. Finally, the Popular Libertarian Army, EPL by its acronym in Spanish, was established in 1968 (Centro de Memoria Histórica, 2018).

Their established mission was to give a voice to the unheard by fighting against inequalities but according to the recorded data available at the Observatory from the Historical Memorial Center of Colombia, between 1988 and 2012, 95 terrorists' attacks occurred in Colombia and were perpetrated by 8 known guerrillas and 1 unknown guerrilla. There were 1555 victims from those confrontations of which 1012 were performed by FARC and 138 by ELN (CNMH, 2018).

The other ways of violence recorded in the Observatory are selective assassinations, war actions, attacks against the population, harm to civil goods, forced displacement, massacres, sexual violence and kidnapping. Violence continues to uproot thousands of people in Colombia despite the signed peace agreement between FARC and government in

2016, a situation which still has an incidence in internally displaced persons and positions the country as the one with the most displaced people even before Syria (UNHCR, 2017). Data showed that it had reached 7.7 million people by 2018 (El Tiempo, 2018). Around 53.000 new displacements occurred in the first half of year 2019, 39.000 of which were associated with the conflict and the other 14.000 with disasters (IDMC, 2020).

Along with the lack of equitable land distribution and conscious property restitution, social inequality represents a main problem in Colombia. The Gini index² historic data from Colombia show how general breaches within its people have prevailed over time. In 1976 Gini was at 0.51, ten years later the figure was 0.46, by 1996 the index was 0.48 (Departamento Nacional de Planeación, 2018), in 2008 it had gone up to 0.55 and by 2016 it descended again to 0.50 (Banco Mundial, 2018). As for land distribution, the available data based on the Gini Index for this sole aspect, it is shown that Colombia has one of the worst relations between equity and land distribution. In year 2000 the index was 0.85, and by 2012 it had increased up to 0.87 (Giraldo, 2015).

Given this reality, the peace agreement signed in 2016 between the Colombian government and the insurgent group FARC had as its first point “Towards a new Colombian field: Integral Rural Reform”, and declared that that reform is to set the foundations for a structural transformation of field contributing to solve the historic causes of the conflict and the unsolved matter of land property rights, particularly its concentration, peasants exclusion and backlog of the rural communities, which affects women and children especially (Gobierno Nacional y FARC-EP, 2016).

Other five points comprehend the complete agreement but instating this topic as the first one on the arrangement represents a huge message regarding the situation on the field and reinforces manifestations made about it. Land grabbing and exploitation of land is one of the central factors of forced displacement in Colombia, indigenous communities are

²Gini index measures the extent to which the distribution of income from people or households within an economy deviates from a perfectly equal distribution, being 0 perfectly equal and 1 implying perfect inequality (Banco Mundial, 2018).

especially vulnerable because mostly live on large collective territories that are rich in nature's resources (biofuel, petrol, coca) or are situated in strategic locations near the border (UNHCR, 2010).

Each of the particularities described above intent to show how difficult it is to compare what happens in one certain territory, in this case Colombia, with what happens in any other given place and to try to standardize the comprehension of a given topic, in this case, tourism and its variations.

Furthermore, the relationship a person has established with her/his territory is profound in the understanding that a territory determines the relationship established by individuals with the space they live in as a means to understanding what has shaped a person in its own uniqueness. The territoriality relation superimposes to the subjects and to the place where they have lived, where privileged experiences in relation to nature were produced, not necessarily pleasurable, which constitute a territory of relations where the subject has been born and endured (territory of origin) or where social and productive relations were established, are references that shape the image of oneself and to the aspirations about the reality in which the daily life experiences is framed (Ocampo Prado, Chenut Prado, Férguson López, & Martínez Carpe, 2017). Territory then means, the identity itself with which a person finds its meaning in terms of belonging and roots.

Colombia is now reaching a historical moment of high complexity, to which it arrives after surviving decades of violence, inequality and war with bloody facts linked to over 1755 guerrilla attacks which took place between 1965 and 2013, left millions of victims and victimizers, institutional uncertainty and multilayered inequality (Navas-Camargo & Cubides-Cardenas, 2018).

The second component: Indigenous community in rural Bogotá

Bogotá is the capital city of Colombia and is home for over eight million inhabitants. It's territory is about 163.663 hectares wide of which 122.257 hectares are rural (Alcaldía

Mayor de Bogotá, 2016). Administratively, Bogotá is divided in 20 localities. Usme is locality number 5 and its location is considered strategic and privileged because of its natural surroundings and closeness to urban Bogotá. The rural area of Usme encompasses 85% of the total territory and constitutes its greatest strategic strength in terms of sustainable production possibilities and systemic ecosystem services offered to the rest of the city. 18.483,9 hectares make up this territory, which is inhabited by more than 1,500 peasant and Indigenous Muisca families, who derive their livelihood from agricultural production. To have a better understanding of why or how tourism can be a way of land preservation, it is first essential to understand how land is distributed in Bogotá and which are the demographic characteristics of the people who live there.

Rural Bogota is a set of neighborhoods where diversity coexists, and inequality, violence and poverty persist. The three main localities that encompass rural Bogotá are Usme, Soacha and Ciudad Bolivar and according to official statistics of the National Department of Statistics (DANE, by its initials in Spanish), three out of ten people there, live in poverty. Nonetheless, they have the responsibility for providing and producing food and other ecosystem related services in supply of urban Bogotá. Those characteristics make Usme a place of convergence among diversity and this context has driven the people into creating a multiplicity of alliances and social networks with the aim of implementing protective actions. For example, the locality shelters, countless youth organizations, corporations and foundations seeking to face socially harmful behaviors such as youth delinquency, vulnerability of the public space, mismanagement of the environment from private companies as well as from the district's administration.

The growing inflow of people has caused cultural and social changes. First, the people who frequently stand in the territory are not all known, traditional meetings are less common, and the patron saint festivities are no longer celebrated. Additionally, the first features of insecurity, increased burglaries poor quality of urban facilities and limitations in access to education and health services are manifested (Pérez Martínez & Villamil Ruiz, 2018). What happens in this territory is also what happens along some of Colombia's extension where day to day life can be a struggle.

The main threat identified is the legal and illegal urban expansion on the peasant and Indigenous territory (Alcaldía Mayor de Bogotá, 2018). The urban growth process in Latin America and the Caribbean has been characterized by a territorial planification that does not consider the natural resources nor the implications for the life quality of its people (LangebeckCuéllar&Beltrán Vargas, 2016). As a response to urban expansion, a first Community-Based Tourism initiative began to operate in Usme over 30 years ago, providing inspiration and have transformed themselves into what they are today. Despite the challenges faced by the inhabitants, the descriptions made are not a totalizing account of a community that for most part is comprised of families trying to live day-to-day, often displaced, negotiating poverty and the absence of state care, or the use of force methods by them as wrongdoing of their real means (ChacónTriana et al., 2018; ChacónTriana, Pinilla Malagón&Hoyos Rojas).

There is pride in the community and a desire to counter negative narratives (Berents& Ten Have, 2017) Members of a family first founded the Agroparque Los Soches as means to resist urban expansion, as well as a way of finding an activity that could keep the young members of the community away from gangs or such and they are proud of their peasant and indigenous roots characteristics. The rural community of Bogotá (which represents 0,2% of all inhabitants), is formed by peasants and Indigenous people from the Muisca tribes primarily, followed by natives of other corners of the country who have been displaced by violence and have been forced to migrate into Bogotá in search of shelter. Next to them, the former members of the revolutionary armed forces who quit weapons have settled in the housing opportunities provided by the government, and the migrants recently arriving have also found a place to stay in Usme, making it a situation not to be overlooked (PóloÁlvis& Serrano López, 2018).

The third component: community becoming the hosts of leisure and tourism related activities

The activity of visiting a place or traveling for recreation, pleasure or business was first regulated in Colombia through Law 300 of 1996, *General Law of Tourism*. In its first article, this law states that tourism should be recognized as an important industry for the country's development implying social growth for all its stakeholders. That law has been constantly updated and significant declarations have been made such as the avowal for it to be a tool for empowering and providing stronger participation for the local communities (MinCIT, 2003). Afterwards, in 2008, the country began to see tourism as an opportunity to place itself in the international arena, and through the program named *Colombia: world class tourism destination*, the development of community related activities was considered strategic (MinCIT, 2008).

By 2011 the concept of Community Based Tourism was introduced in the local context and the activity was called to be a *prosperity factor* (MinCIT, 2011). Tourism was installed within a democratic perspective that is only obvious if the people are able to make their own decisions and enjoy political, civil, cultural, social and environmental rights, among every other right. Such an approach is what Caldera (2018a) calls the Integral Democracy, that is, a kind of democracy understood as holistic and whole and that in which a human being is able to achieve their expectations thanks to the work being done by the State (Caldera Ynfante, Ávila Hernández, & De los Santos Olivo, 2018a). Later, it was contemplated as a development tool for the poor and the indigenous communities, which presented touristic potential, so microcredits for the development of the activity was to be granted (MinCIT, 2014). On 2018, the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) of tourism in Colombia had grown by 24% since 2012, and it had surpassed the growth presented by the general GDP of the country that had only grown by 17% (Portafolio, 2018).

This way, tourism has increasingly gained attention and it has helped both visitors and hosts to be more conscious about how to practice the activity. As stated by Emna, Meško, Dobovšek and Sotlar (2013), every present society faces environmental crimes as

one more of the many threats presented to human and wildlife given the endless exploitation of natural resources and pollution, therefore one should find ways to make peaceful resistance which can lead to positive outcomes and not just coding, pointing out or classifying what is wrong. Violations are present in various forms such as land grabs and forced displacement, loss of livelihoods, compromised access to water and other essential natural resources, environmental degradation, poor working conditions, exclusion from decision-making processes, cultural erosion and sexual exploitation of women and children (Barnett, 2011). Such violations are constantly present in the industry of tourism and are also commonly seen in the development of social interactions within Usme. Therefore, finding means of peaceful resistance for these undesirable outcomes, is to be valued.

Tourism has traditionally been linked to practices that result in human rights violations, negative impacts on the environment and cultural mistreatment. It has been widely discussed how that activity represents a profound disconnection from what a traveler finds at destination in this leisure activity, and the reality lived behind curtains by the locals who host them. Forced evictions in order to build airports, golf courses or hotels are usual in countries like Ghana, Indonesia or Philippines, and are particularly worrying for vulnerable communities such as the indigenous peoples or agricultural workers who don't hold title deeds of the lands they live in (Kamp, 2009). The same happens in the opposite side of the world in countries like Ecuador, Mexico (BBC News, 2018) and Colombia, and the anxiety of losing the natural resources and biodiversity, as well as the preoccupation of the natives being evicted from their lands is still latent. Natural non-renewable resources become tourist attractions which often result breached given the lack of policies and procedures which aim for their preservation, and what is understood as a sacred tradition for a determined ethnicity, is quickly transformed into a commercial product to be sold as a souvenir in what is known as the fastest growing services industry in the world (Eriksson, Noble, Pattullo, & Barnett, 2009), tourism. It is distinguishing in that industry to see underpaid, intermittent and unworthy jobs occupied primarily by women. Therefore, a well-founded fear exists around the development of tourist related activities and despite with much resistance, it has recently begun to be seen as an alternative to serve

as tool for poverty alleviation, but which needs to have better policy regulations incorporating a legal morality (Galán Galindo, 2016).

Nonetheless, tourism is still affirmed to be one of the main income sources for many developing countries and is called to be a key driver for socio-economic progress (World Tourism Organization, 2018), it is also one of the world's broadest employers providing work mostly for women and youth (Sheik, 2018). As stated by Campbell (2002), Forstner (2004), Markandya et al. (2005) and Vaughan (2002) in Dodds, Ali & Galaski, tourism is to be perceived as an effective tool which can help create *added* income into areas where conservation affects local populations' traditional livelihoods (Dodds, Ali, & Galaski, 2018), but it is not to be overseen the emphasis made in regards of identifying the activity as added, and not primary for in this way one can also understand why the actions are mainly pursued by women instead of men, as explained further ahead. The World Tourism Organization emphasizes the need of undergoing accomplishments in this industry and is emphatic in confirming that tourism in many developing and least developed countries is the most viable and sustainable economic development option because of its capacity of creating direct and indirect employment, more precisely one in every 12 jobs worldwide is tourism related (World Tourism Organization, 2010) or as much as one of every six people are employed in tourism in places like Malta (EUROSTAT, 2018). These facts show why is it important to pay closer attention to what happens in tourist related endeavors.

Community-based tourism lies its principles in the necessity of facing those negative impacts and providing a tool for the local communities to develop the tourism related activities under a frame of communitarian cohesion. CBT is an endogenous alternative to outsourced tourism strategies in poorly developed regions, which enables the creation of specific destinations that allow local communities to generate wealth with a new complementary activity, never a substitution, of the traditional dominant one. It is, therefore, a form of sustainable tourism based on the community that aims to satisfy the needs of both residents and current tourists without compromising the needs of future generations, who live or visit the tourist destination (Álvarez-García, Durán-Sánchez, & Del Río-Rama, 2018). One of its main characteristics is that activities are initiated by their

own, and not imposed by external actors. Also, in addition to the traditional undertakings of tourism linked to leisure and the use of free time, this kind of tourism allows the visitor to have an educational experience. It is one of the purposes of those undertakings to have the visitor learn new ways of being and new ways of doing things while showing respect for local traditions. Through CBT activities it is possible to live a true intercultural experience, understanding that interculturality is to be conceived as a means for creating a better, more understandable and peaceful society where the voice and the diverse opinions are taken into account, all of which should be appointed into consolidating a better, more wholesome community (Navas-Camargo & Montoya Ruíz, 2018).

The fourth component - divergence in the understanding of CBT in the south and in the north

A community leader from Usme learned about Community-Based Tourism through a visit made to another region of Colombia back in the 1980`s and was able to connect his own people with the principles of this activity. On an interview with him, he narrated over which epitomes the Agroparque Los Soches was founded. Mr. Villaba stated in a personal conversation on March 17, 2012 that:

I started writing little things that could come up with a project, so I put the name, ‘Los Soches’ came out, I don’t know where it came from... the imagination. Then Agroparque and I left the name because here in the village, Soches is the name given to the moorland deer’s. It’s a deer that existed here.... we needed to do something that gave strength to the land and not be urbanized. It had to have four aspects. A social aspect, you have to do a job with the social community, here the one who had money overlooked the other ones, so it was important for all of us to know that we are all human beings, and all human beings are worth the same, because of who we are and not because of what we have. The other aspect I said is to be important is the environment, we needed to do something to protect the environment, so it was also written down. The other thing was the cultural part because we had to get back our roots, we were losing our peasant and indigenous identity because of being so close to the city, and for us it was important to preserve that identity. And the other aspect was the economical, because if a project didn’t generate resources, you can’t live out of illusions.

Those four aspects were established and from there I began to manage the project (Villalba, 2012).

Agroparque Los Soches was then initiated over the visualization Mr. Villaba had, and became the first tourism related activity to be offered in Usme. Communitarian work and self-management of the territory, in order to welcome foreigners into short visits which at the same time permitted a learning experience for both sides. They have been carrying on this idea over time, and even though the location where operations take place doesn't compare to what an experienced tourist might expect given the deterioration it presents, they managed to have a recognition from the government and were able to stop the proliferation of urban constructions that would have forced them to live in what they called “matchsticks boxes who would have killed them in life”. Hence the local community welcomed the initiative, women found themselves to be much more appealed to the idea of having such an activity where hospitality was a centerpiece and the creation of crafts and agriculturally derived goods were to be commercialized. Men had a greater disposition to perform duties based on body strength, like preparing the ground for agriculture, working the land and raising the animals; perhaps as a way of detaining power. Consequently, crafting, cooking, hosting and guiding visitors was a responsibility carried out by women, and thanks to them that same initiative has expand into other districts within Usme. What began in a single community (in the District of Agroparque Los Soches), was then also pursued by women from other areas leading them to have a broader offer in regard to CBT within Usme.

Circuits along the territories are guided by the locals, through which visitors are invited to “live the experience” of being a peasant for a day. In *La Requilina*, tourists are able to visit 12 different farms after paying something between \$7 and \$10 US dollars, depending on the activities they want to access. Each farm belongs to a different family who holds a distinctive tradition, for example in one of them visitors can learn to grow or harvest onion, quinoa, coriander or beans, in some others they have the chance to make crafts and knitwear using local sheep's wool. *Agroparque Los Soches* specializes in guiding

tourists through paths alongside *Páramo de Sumapaz* (Moorland Sumapaz) where it's possible to see and learn about plants and birds' diversity.

The country's biodiversity has a magnificent disclosure through birds, being recognized as the world's country with the greatest diversity in bird species (Maldonado, et al., 2018). Hence bird watching has purveyed an opportunity to be incorporated within the possibilities of nature-based tourism. If the visit is guided by members of *Asociación Turismo Rural Comunitario Ciudad Bolívar* (The Rural Communitarian Tourism Association of Ciudad Bolívar), tourists are more likely to have a horseback riding experience, do some hiking, prepare cheese, soups, breads and meats arranged by the native traditions, as well as taste local fruits, legumes, root vegetables and honey. Each initiative has something to offer and the philosophy behind them is that of a consolidated community practicing an activity that enables them to stay in the territory they worship and pursue the works they like whilst simultaneously preserving nature, the environment and the local culture. It is a way of incorporating the diverse cosmovisions and pluralisms of cultures (Llano-Franco, 2016).

Agroparque Los Soches, La Requilina and *Asociación Turismo Rural Comunitario Ciudad Bolívar*, are the three most representative initiatives, of community-based tourism settled in rural Bogotá. They are all managed by women and among the success they are accountable for are being able to preserve their beloved territory and retaining the young people in the territory because of the development of an activity which made them feel proud of who they are, is noticeable. As stated by Goyes (2016), rural people suffer tremendously from environmental victimization and the best way to obtain sound contextualized knowledge of their environmental problems is to open dialog with them. The practice of advancing academic knowledge by the interaction with the knowledges of the marginalized and impoverished should be permeated by a teleological activist practice in which the end is not science or knowledge in itself but the prevention of harm (Goyes, 2016).

What has been done in rural Bogotá, can represent an answer to the call made by Brisman and South when stated that green criminologists have a lot to contribute with by documenting and registering the resistance presented to environmental crimes, made either by traditional sociopolitical organizations, the “omnipresent movements” or the “do it yourself” activism (Brisman & South, 2017: 107). Members of the local community have come together to “do for themselves”, what any political movement hasn’t been able to do for them and their accomplishments are noticeable. It shall also not be overseen that very few countries account for around 60%-70% of the world’s biodiversity, among them Brazil, Colombia, Ecuador, Peru, Mexico, Congo, Madagascar, China, India, Indonesia, Malaysia and Australia (Gossling, 1999). So, the work done by the community represents an impact of significant dimensions and through the identification of the varifold ways of taking part in the industry, communities have been able to empower themselves and are now managing tourism related activities as a means of land preservation, community consolidation and female empowerment. Women of these communities are the ones who have been preserving over the years the idea of practicing tourism related activities to maintain what is sacred for them.

A first visit to the territory was made in year 2012, accompanied by interviews with the leaders of the three initiatives was pursued as well as a process of tourism related capacity building was held. A follow up to the development of the initiatives throughout time was made until year 2018, finding that La Requilina has made significant changes which denote a learning process and an accommodation of their proposals to a market-oriented scenario without losing sight of their primary purpose of communitarian cohesion. Los Soches has suffered from disintegration of its members, and a small part of young men from the previous group have decided to work on their own. The majority is still represented by the women who are still working for the well-being of the community. The *Asociación Turismo Rural Comunitario* from Ciudad Bolívar, has widened their proposal and nowadays offer the possibilities of practicing diverse ways of tourism such as Ecotourism, Agrotourism, Community-Based tourism and Gastronomic Tourism.

Women are the ones responsible of widening the perspective they had over tourism-based opportunities and have been able to provide a new method for the activity. A multidisciplinary approach is then offered to a problem, which involves the self-proclamation of the human species as the holder of the right to exploit nature as well as other species (Sollund, 2018). The coping into new ways of living can then be perceived in a multi-layered way. First, because that resilience came as a response to prevent expulsion from their land and turned out to be something positive and previously unthought of. But also, because the female empowerment came subsidiary to their main intention of defending the territory.

Their actions have triggered the realization of a life project and therefore by being able to preserve what is important for them as a manifestation of liberty, freedom and life itself. Tourism is being developed from within as a means of peaceful resistance and through communitarian cohesion. Not only local domination from the State has been stopped, but also that kind of domination that comes from outside as a way of consensual foreign domination (Caldera Ynfante, 2018b), and which is very common in the tourism related industries.

Conclusions

The activities developed around the CBT initiatives in Usme, derived in a safeguard for environmental preservation, as well as the establishment of a communitarian sense of belonging, and personal growth. The intentions that Mr. Villalba had when creating Agroparque Los Soches have prevailed over time and the young members of the community found in it a way of making their lives purposeful through them being able to to detain urban expansion in what should be preserved territories. CBT has become a tool against the perpetration of wrongdoings against wildlife and humans.

In accordance with what Lynch (1990/2006) defined by green criminology, that is a variety of class related injustices that maintain an inequitable distribution of power while destroying human life, generating hunger, uprooting and poisoning the environment of all

classes, peoples and animals as cited in Goyes and South(2017); and following the indirect suggestion made by Brisman (2014: 29) when citing Halsey (2004) about how when “*criminalizing a behavior is a very poor way of reducing its occurrence*”, the strive is to present a positive perspective of tourism, knowing that it is an activity loved by almost everyone but that given the misuse of it has been derailed and doomed to be a representation of degradation. It is then proposed to engage in consciously planned, community involved and lead by, environmentally safe and culturally respectful, tourism activities as a way of detaining crimes against nature, and in a pursue to show the north how the traditional knowledges of the south are not to be overlooked.

Arriving into Usme has become easier overtime due the development of public transportation alternatives, but members of urban Bogotá resist visiting that territory. The security perception of that side of the city is negative and the social segregation characteristic in Colombia has a direct influence on the decision-making process. Those who belong to the upper socioeconomic levels are more likely to have tourism related activities somewhere else, so the chances of becoming a perdurable tourist attraction relies solely on few possibilities. Schools making field trips to recognize natural diversity, enterprises wanting to show corporate social responsibility by contributing to the economic development of a marginalized part of the city and foreigners who appreciate the natural scenery presented there, are the main visitors present in the initiatives. That is the reason why the economic income hasn't been comparable to other tourism related activities. But they are not poor and when we understand that the environment, the land, our culture and ourselves is all that we truly have, activities like CBT would be highly valued. It is a way of cognitive justice and an example of social divergence applied in a transdisciplinary reality that can help in the endeavor of crossing the bridge to narrow global divides by including multiple voices as stated in the southern criminology project (Carrington et al, 2019).

Acknowledgements

The present paper is part of the result of the research Project titled “Contemporary challenges for the Human Rights protection in posconflict scenarios – Phase II”. The Project belongs to the research line *Human Rights foundations and implementations*, from the research group *Persons, Institutions and Demands of Justice*, code COL0120899– type *A1* from *COLCIENCIAS*, Faculty of Law, Universidad Católica de Colombia.

References

- Adger, Neil W. (2000). "Social and ecological resilience: Are they related?", *Progress in Human Geography*, Vol. 24, No. 3, pp. 347-364.
- Alcaldía Mayor de Bogotá. (2016). *Bogotá Mejor para Todos*. Retrieved from: <http://www.bogota.gov.co/article/temas-de-ciudad/desarrollo-economico/en-bogota-4.353-hogares-estan-en-la-ruralidad>.
- Alcaldía Mayor de Bogotá. (2018). *Secretaría Distrital de Planeación*. Retrieved from Banco Distrital de Programas y Proyectos: <https://produccioncientificaluz.org/index.php/opcion/article/download/24007/24452>.
- Álvarez-García, José; Durán-Sánchez, Amador & Río-Rama, María de la Cruz del. (2018). "Scientific Coverage in Community-Based Tourism: Sustainable Tourism and Strategy for Social Development", *Sustainability*, Vol. 10, No. 4, pp. 1-18.
- Asociación de Turismo Rural Comunitario Ciudad Bolívar. *Asociación Turismo Rural Comunitario Ciudad Bolívar*. <http://www.turismoruralcomunitario.org/atractivos/turismo-en-ciudad-bolivar/7-salidas-de-campo/50-tradicion-y-cultura>. Access: 2018-7-3.
- Banco Mundial. (2018, August 24). *Data Catalog*. Retrieved from World - All The Ginis 1950-2012: <http://search.worldbank.org/data?qterm=GINI&language=EN&op=>
- Barnett, Patricia. (2011). "Time for tourism industry to put human rights on its agenda", *Institute for Human Rights and Business*. Retrieved from: <https://www.ihrb.org/focus-areas/migrant-workers/commentary-tourism-industry-human-rights>.
- Berents, Helen & Ten Have, Charlotte. (2017). "Navigating Violence: Fear and Everyday Life in Colombia and Mexico", *International Journal for Crime, Justice and Social Democracy*, Vol. 6. No. 1, pp. 103-117.
- Bollentino, Vincenzo; Alacyna, Tilly; Dy, Philip & Vinck, Patrick. (2017). "Introduction to Socio-Ecological Resilience", *Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Natural Hazard Science*, pp. 1-35.
- Brisman, Avi. (2014). "Of Theory and Meaning in Green Criminology", *International Journal for Crime, Justice and Social Democracy*, Vol. 3, No. 2, pp. 21-34.

- Brisman, Avi & South, Nigel. (2017). "Criminología Verde Cultural". In: Hanneke Mol; David Rodríguez Goyes; Nigel South & Avi Brisman. *Introducción a la Criminología Verde* (pp. 97-127). Bogotá, Editorial Temis Obras Jurídicas & Universidad Antonio Nariño.
- Caldera Ynfante, Jesús Enrique; Ávila Hernández, Flor; & De Los Santos Olivo, Isidro. (2018a). "La forja del Estado democrático constitucional en Venezuela y su relación con la democracia integral", *Utopía y Praxis Latinoamericana*, Vol. 23, No. Suppl. 2, pp. 75-97.
- Caldera Ynfante, Jesús Enrique. (2018b). *Sobre la dominación extranjera consentida en Venezuela: Análisis acerca del Movimiento de Liberación Nacional atípico como posible herramienta político-jurídica en la lucha por su Segunda Independencia*. Retrieved from XIX Congreso Nacional, IX Latinoamericano de Sociología Jurídica:
http://www.sasju.org.ar/interfaz/blog_nivel_3/165/archivos/congreso-uba2018.pdf
- Carlyle Beyer, Robert Carlyle. (1961). "Land Distribution and Tenure in Colombia", *Journal of Inter-American Studies*, Vol. 3, No. 2, pp. 281-290.
- Carrington, Kerry; Dixon, Bill; Fonseca, David; Rodríguez Goyes, David; Liu, Jianhong & Zysman, Diego. (2019). "Criminologies of the Global South: Critical Reflections", *Critical Criminology*, Vol. 7, No. 1.
- Centro de Memoria Histórica. *Centro de Memoria Histórica*. Retrieved from: <http://www.centrodememoriahistorica.gov.co/>. Access: 2018-5-7.
- Centro de Memoria Histórica. *Observatorio de Memoria y Conflicto*. Retrieved from: <http://centrodememoriahistorica.gov.co/observatorio/bases-de-datos/>. Access: 2018-9-14.
- Chacón Triana, Nathalia; Pinilla Malagón, Julián & Hoyos Rojas, Juan Carlos. (2018). "La Protección De Los Derechos Humanos A La Luz De Las Nuevas Obligaciones Internacionales Frente A La Lucha Contra El Terrorismo", *Utopía Y Praxis Latinoamericana*, Vol. 23, No. Suppl. 2, pp. 152-161.
- Chacón Triana, Natalia; Rodríguez Bejarano, Carolina & Cubides-Cárdenas, Jaime. (2018). "Protección De Los Derechos Fundamentales Y Terrorismo: Dilemas En El Uso De La Fuerza", *Revista Espacios*, Vol. 39, No. 16, pp. 28-36.

- “Colombia volvió ser el país con más desplazados internos”. (2018, June 19). *El Tiempo*.
<https://www.eltiempo.com/justicia/conflicto-y-narcotrafico/colombia-volvio-ser-el-pais-con-mas-desplazados-internos-en-el-mundo-segun-la-acnur-232658>.
- Departamento Nacional de Planeación. (En línea). *Estudios Económicos*. Retrieved from EstadísticasHistóricas de Colombia: <https://www.dnp.gov.co/estudios-y-publicaciones/estudios-economicos/Paginas/estadisticas-historicas-de-colombia.aspx>. Access: 2018-4-4.
- Dodds, Rachel; Ali, Alisha & Galaski, Kelly. (2018). “Mobilizing knowledge: determining key elements for success and pitfalls in developing community-based tourism”, *Current Issues in Tourism*, Vol. 21, No. 3, pp. 1547-1568.
- Eman, Katja; Meško, Gorazd; Dobovšek, Bojan & Sotlar, Andrej. (2013). “Environmental crime and green criminology in South Eastern Europe-practice and research”, *Crime, Law and Social Change*, Vol. 59, No. 3, pp. 341-358.
- En seis años el PIB del turismo creció 24%. (2018, March 8). *Portafolio*. Recuperado de: <http://www.portafolio.co/economia/en-seis-anos-el-pib-del-turismo-crecio-24-515062>.
- Eriksson, Jenny; Noble, Rachel; Pattullo, Polly & Barnett, Tricia. (2009). *Tourism Concern*. Retrieved from: https://www.tourismconcern.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2014/10/LowRes_Putting-Tourism-to-Rights_A-report-by-TourismConcern2.pdf.
- EUROSTAT. (2018). *Tourism industries - employment*. Retrieved from: https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/statistics-explained/index.php/Tourism_industries_-_employment.
- Galán Galindo, Astrid Rocío. (2016). “Los derechos humanos fundamentados mediante la legitimación y la moral jurídica”, *Novum Jus*, Vol. 10, No. 1, pp. 31-48.
- Giraldo, Omar Felipe. (2015). *Biodiversidad, Sustento y Cultura*. Retrieved from Acaparamiento de tierras en Colombia: <https://www.grain.org/es/article/entries/5249-descargue-la-revista-completa-biodiversidad-85-2015-3>.
- Gobierno Nacional y Fuerzas Armadas Revolucionarias de Colombia - Ejército del Pueblo. (2016). *Acuerdo final para la terminación del conflicto y la construcción de una paz*

- estable* y *duradera*. Retrieved from <http://www.altocomisionadoparalapaz.gov.co/procesos-y-conversaciones/Documentos%20compartidos/24-11-2016NuevoAcuerdoFinal.pdf>.
- Gossling, Stefan. (1999). "Ecotourism: a means to safeguard biodiversity and ecosystem functions?", *Ecological Economics*, Vol. 29, No. 2, pp. 303-320.
- Holling, Crawford S. (1973). "Resilience and Stability of Ecological Systems", *Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics*, Vol. 4, No. 1, pp. 1-23.
- Internal Displacement Monitoring Centre. *Colombia*. <https://www.internal-displacement.org/countries/colombia>. Access: 2020-1-17.
- Johnston, Alison. (2000). "Indigenous Peoples and Ecotourism: Bringing Indigenous Knowledge and Rights into the Sustainability Equation", *Tourism Recreation Research*, Vol. 25, No. 2, pp. 89-96.
- Kabeer, Naila. (1998). *Realidades trastocadas: las jerarquías de género en el pensamiento del desarrollo*. (1a ed.). Madrid, Paidós.
- Kamp, Christina. (2009). Human Rights – A Primary Responsibility, *Tourism Watch - InformationsdienstTourismus und Entwicklung*. Retrieved from: <https://www.tourism-watch.de/en/content/human-rights-%E2%80%93-primary-responsibility>.
- Keeves, J.P. (1987). Longitudinal Research Methods. In: *Economics of Education*. Oxford; New York, Pergamon Press, pp. 369-382.
- LangebeckCuéllar, Evelin Langebeck& Beltrán Vargas, Julio Eduardo. (2016). "Sustentabilidad territorial de los procesos de ocupación urbano-rural en la localidad quinta de Bogotá, Colombia", *Gestión y Ambiente*, Vol. 19, No. 1, pp. 13-33.
- Llano-Franco, Jairo Vladimir. (2016). "Pluralismo Jurídico, Diversidad Cultural, Identidades, Globalización y Multiculturalismo: Perspectivas desde la Ciencia Jurídica", *Novum Jus*, Vol. 10, No. 1 (ene-jun), pp. 49-92.
- Los lugares más hermosos del mundo que están amenazados por el turismo. (7 de mayo de 2018). *BBC News*. *BBC Mundo*. https://www.bbc.com/mundo/noticias/2016/05/160519_ciencia_medio_ambiente_paisos_peligro_turismo_isla_everest_gtg.

- MacAskill, Kristen & Guthrie, Peter. (2014). "Multiple Interpretations of Resilience in Disaster Risk Management", *Procedia Economics and Finance*, Vol. 18, No. Suppl. C, pp. 667-674.
- Maldonado, Jorge H., Moreno-Sánchez, Rocío del Pilar; Espinoza, Sophía; Bruner, Aaron; Garzón, Natalia & Myers, John. (2018). "Peace is much more than doves: The economic benefits of bird-based tourism as a result of the peace treaty in Colombia", *World Development*, Vol. 106, pp. 78-86.
- McClanahan, Bill; Sánchez Parra, Tatiana & Brisman, Avi. (2019). "Conflicto, ambiente y transición. Colombia, ecología y turismo después de la desmovilización", *Crítica Penal y Poder*, No. 16, pp. 99-120.
- Ministerio de Comercio, Industria y Turismo (MinCIT). (2003). "Plan Sectorial de Turismo 2003-2006", *Turismo para un nuevo país*, Colombia.
- Ministerio de Comercio, Industria y Turismo (MinCIT). (2008, January). "Plan sectorial de turismo 2008-2010", *Colombia, destino turístico de clase mundial*, Colombia.
- Ministerio de Comercio, Industria y Turismo (MinCIT). (2011, January). "Plan sectorial de turismo 2011-2014", *Turismo factor de prosperidad*, Colombia.
- Ministerio de Comercio, Industria y Turismo (MinCIT). (2014, January). "Plan sectorial de turismo 2014-2018", *Turismo para la construcción de paz*, Colombia.
- Navas-Camargo, Fernanda & Zwerg-Villegas, Anne Marie. (2014). "Community Based Tourism: is this progress?", *Revista Ciencias Estratégicas*, Vol. 22, No. 32, pp. 249-259.
- Navas-Camargo, Fernanda & Cubides-Cárdenas, Jaime. (2018). "Los derechos económicos, sociales, culturales y ambientales en periodo de posconflicto: un reto por cumplir." In: Jaime Cubides Cárdenas & Tania Giovanna Vivas Barrera (Eds.), *Responsabilidad internacional y protección ambiental: en tiempos de paz, en medio del conflicto y en etapas de posconflicto*, Bogotá, Universidad Católica de Colombia, pp. 261-280.
- Navas-Camargo, Fernanda & Montoya Ruíz, Sandra. (2018). "The Need of Having an Intercultural Approach, in the Welcome Mechanisms, in the Welcome Mechanisms of Migrants and Refugees in Bogotá. Policy Review, Learning from Others, Making Poposals", *Utopía y Praxis Latinoamericana*, Vol. 23, Suppl. 2, pp. 114-126.

- Navas-Camargo, Fernanda, Cubides-Cárdenas, Jaime, & Caldera Ynfante, Jesús Enrique. (2018). "Human rights encouragement through peaceful resistance initiatives in rural Bogotá", *Opción. Revista de ciencias humanas y sociales*, Vol. 34, No. 18, pp. 2101-2126.
- Ocampo Prado, Myriam; Chenut Correa, Philippe; López, Mayerlín Ferguson & Martínez Carpetá, Mabel. (2017). "Territorialities in transition: population displaced by the violence of the Colombian armed conflict resignifying the territory", *Psicología USP*, Vol. 28, No. 2, pp. 165-178.
- Pérez Martínez, Manuel Enrique & Villamil Ruiz, Edna Jessenia. (2018). "From the urban-rural territorialities to the transformations of the landscape: A case study in la requilina village, the town of usme, south of the city of Bogotá (Colombia), 1985 – 2016", *Revista Luna Azul*, pp. 285-310.
- PóloÁlvis, Sebastián & Serrano López, Enrique. (2018). "Nueva República, Nuevo Horizonte, Nuevo Porvenir: Las Migraciones Colombianas hacia Chile, 1990-2016", *Novum Jus*, pp. 165-188.
- Rodríguez Goyes, David. (2016). "Green Activist Criminology and the Epistemologies of the South", *Critical Criminology*, Vol. 24, No.4, pp. 503-518.
- Rodríguez Goyes, David & South, Nigel. (2017). "Green Criminology before 'Green Criminology': Amnesia and Absences", *Critical Criminology*, Vol. 25, No. 2, pp. 165-181.
- Rodríguez Goyes, David; Sollund, Ragnhild & South, Nigel. (2019). "Special issue. Towards global green criminological dialogues: Voices from the Americas and Europe", *International Journal for Crime, Justice and Social Democracy*, Vol. 8, No. 3, pp.1-5.
- Romero, Laura Dulce & Téllez Oliveros, Verónica. (2014, August 12). "La Requilina, una historia de resistencia", *El Espectador*. Retrieved from: <https://www.elespectador.com/noticias/bogota/requilina-una-historia-de-resistencia-articulo-510049>.
- Ruiz-Ballesteros, Esteban. (2011). "Social-ecological resilience and community-based tourism: An approach from Agua Blanca, Ecuador", *Tourism Management*, Vol. 32, No. 3, pp. 655-666.

- Secretariado Nacional de las FARC-EP. *Quiénes somos y por qué luchamos*.
<https://www.farc-ep.co/nosotros.html>. Access: 2018-2-17.
- Silva-García, Germán. (2012). “De la desviación a la divergencia: introducción a la teoría sociológica del delito”, *Derecho y Realidad*, Vol. 10, No. 19.
- Sollund, Ragnhild. (2017). “Doing Green, Critical Criminology with an Auto-Ethnographic, Feminist Approach”, *Critical Criminology*, Vol. 25, No. 2, pp. 245-260.
- Sollund, Ragnhild. (2018). “Tráfico y comercio de cuerpos humanos y animales: una perspectiva ecofeminista sobre delitos y victimización”. In: Hanneke Mol; David Rodríguez Goyes; Nigel South & Avi Brisman (Eds.). *Introducción a la Criminología Verde* (pp. 276-297). Bogotá, Editorial Temis Obras Jurídicas & Universidad Antonio Nariño.
- United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR). (2010). *To lose our land is to lose ourself. Indigenous people and forced displacement in Colombia*. Retrieved from UNHCR. The UN Refugee Agency: http://www.unhcr.org/fileadmin/Documents/RefugiadosAmericas/Colombia/EN/Indigenous_people_and_forced_displacement_in_Colombia.pdf.
- United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR). (2017, March 10). *Forced displacement growing in Colombia despite peace agreement*. Retrieved from UNHCR. The UN Refugee Agency: <http://www.unhcr.org/news/briefing/2017/3/58c26e114/forced-displacement-growing-colombia-despite-peace-agreement.html>.
- Villalba, Belisario. (2012). *Narración acerca del surgimiento del Agroparque Los Soches* / Interviewed by Fernanda Navas-Camargo.
- World Tourism Organization. (2018, May 8). *Sharm Sheikh*. Retrieved from Opening Statement at the UNWTO Regional Conference on Human Capital Development in Tourism: New Perspectives in Egypt: <http://www2.unwto.org/content/opening-statement-unwto-regional-conference-human-capital-development-tourism-new-perspective>.
- World Tourism Organization. (2018, July 21). *Why Tourism?* Retrieved from Tourism – an economic and social phenomenon: <http://www2.unwto.org/content/why-tourism>.

World Tourism Organization. (2010, October 17). *Tourism and Poverty Alleviation*. Retrieved from The Special Position of Tourism in Poverty Alleviation: <http://step.unwto.org/content/tourism-and-poverty-alleviation-1>.